

MINUTES

**HISTORICAL PRESERVATION COMMISSION
FIRST FLOOR COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT CONFERENCE ROOM
MARCH 14, 2002
5:00 P.M.**

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 5:00 P.M.

ATTENDANCE

Present: Cathy Johnson, Chairwoman
Darlene Petersen
Tom Lennon
Doug Sydnor
Janet Wilson

Absent: Patricia Myers

Staff: Don Meserve
Debbie Abele
Bob Cafarella

Visitors: Tom Giller, Sam West, Anselm Bischoff, Davida Schiffman Smith

PUBLIC HEARING/ACTION ITEMS

Initiation of HP – Historic Property Zoning

Ms. Able stated that the public hearing action items before the Commission is initiation of HP- Historic Public overlay zoning to place properties on the Scottsdale Historic Register. Ms. Able referred to the chart that describes the steps that need to be taken to determine if a property is to be placed on the Scottsdale Historic Register. She further stated that the overlay zoning does no effect the zoning. She reviewed the process that has taken place. Ms. Able reported that the Commission couldn't discuss the specifics or the merits about the property.

Chairwoman Johnson requested that the Historic Preservation Commission consider initiating an HP overlay zoning case for the Valley Ho (Ramada Valley Ho).

(There was no public testimony)

MOTION WAS MADE by Commissioner Sydnor for INITIATION OF HP – HISTORIC PROPERTY ZONING FOR VALLEY HO (RAMADA VALLEY HO) AT 6850 E. MAIN STREET TO PLACE THE PROPERTY ON THE SCOTTSDALE HISTORIC REGISTER. MOTION WAS SECONDED by Commissioner Petersen, WHICH CARRIED 5-0.

Chairwoman Johnson requested that the Historic Preservation Commission consider initiating an HP overlay zoning case for Adobe Motor Apartments (El Adobe) to place the property on the Scottsdale Historic Register.

(There was no public testimony)

MOTION WAS MADE by Commissioner Sydnor for INITIATION OF HP – HISTORIC PROPERTY ZONING FOR ADOBE MOTOR APARTMENTS (EL ADOBE) AT 7041 E. 1ST AVENUE TO PLACE THE PROPERTY ON THE SCOTTSDALE HISTORIC REGISTER. MOTION WAS SECONDED by Commissioner Wilson, WHICH CARRIED 5-0.

Chairwoman Johnson requested that the Historic Preservation Commission consider initiating an HP overlay zoning case for Pima Plaza (Old Town Plaza) to place the property on the Scottsdale Historic Register.

Chairwoman Johnson opened public testimony.

Tom Giller stated he represents Brooks Building Inc. He further stated that he has just recently received the information regarding the designation and he has yet to form an opinion. If later they decide it is not in their best interest to support this process, they would bring their objection forward.

Chairwoman Johnson closed public testimony.

Commissioner Sydnor commented that there are many steps left in the process that would allow the property owner opportunity to provide input.

MOTION WAS MADE by Commissioner Petersen for INITIATION OF HP – HISTORIC PROPERTY ZONING FOR PIMA PLAZA (OLD TOWN PLAZA AT 7221-7235 E. 1ST AVENUE TO PLACE THE PROPERTY ON THE SCOTTSDALE HISTORIC REGISTER. MOTION WAS SECONDED by Commissioner Wilson, WHICH CARRIED 5-0.

Chairwoman Johnson requested that the Historic Preservation Commission consider initiating an HP overlay zoning case for Craftsman Court to place the property on the Scottsdale Historic Register.

(There was no public testimony.)

MOTION WAS MADE by Commissioner Sydnor for INITIATION OF HP – HISTORIC PROPERTY ZONING FOR CRAFTSMAN COURT AT 7121-7141 E. 5TH AVENUE TO PLACE THE PROPERTY ON THE SCOTTSDALE HISTORIC REGISTER. MOTION WAS SECONDED by Commissioner Petersen, WHICH CARRIED 5-0.

Chairwoman Johnson requested that the Historic Preservation Commission consider initiating an HP overlay zoning case for Valley Bank (Bank One) to place the property on the Scottsdale Historic Register.

(There was no public testimony.)

MOTION WAS MADE by Commissioner Wilson for INITIATION OF HP – HISTORIC PROPERTY ZONING FOR VALLEY BANK AT 4031 N. SCOTTSDALE ROAD TO PLACE THE PROPERTY ON THE SCOTTSDALE HISTORIC REGISTER. MOTION WAS SECONDED by Commissioner Sydnor, WHICH CARRIED 5-0.

Chairwoman Johnson requested that the Historic Preservation Commission consider initiating an HP overlay zoning case for Bank of Douglas (Bischoff's Gallery) to place the property on the Scottsdale Historic Register.

Chairwoman Johnson opened public testimony.

Sam West, architect, stated he would request that this property be removed from the list because it does not qualify. He presented the Commission with handouts with copies of photographs, that outlined why he felt this property should be removed from the list. He reported that the property is not 50 years old.

Ms. Abele stated that the current ordinance does not have an age requirement. Mr. West stated the previous ordinance had an age requirement and they would like to be held to that standard.

Mr. West discussed the series of photographs that showed that there have been dramatic changes made to the building.

Anselm Bischoff stated when he purchased this building the previous owner stated he would like to see the integrity of the building maintained.

Mr. West stated they want to add a second story to this building. They have discussed this idea with the adjacent neighbors and they have seen the design and they are all comfortable. He further stated they would like to go ahead with this Development Review Board (DRB) submittal process without the historic overlay going on simultaneously with trying to do the addition to the building. He reiterated that he felt the building did not qualify.

Commissioner Sydnor reiterated that the 50-year requirement does not apply to this ordinance. He stated he felt the nature of the changes have been in keeping with the integrity of the building. He further stated at a future meeting the Commission would be looking at a process for adding second stories to historic buildings.

Commissioner Petersen noted that many people have requested this property be put on the historic register. She further noted that putting this property on the historic register does not stop them from adding a second story.

Mr. West stated that he has been involved in situations where outside influences have made the project worse. He further stated he would like to continue with the freedom he had to start with.

Mr. Bischoff stated they would treat this building as a historical building regardless if it is put on the register. They want to preserve this building for future generations.

Chairwoman Johnson noted that this is just the beginning of the process.

Mr. West stated that for the record he would request that this process would not have any affect on any decisions or processes by any other agencies of the City of Scottsdale.

Chairwoman Johnson closed public testimony.

MOTION WAS MADE by Commissioner Sydnor for INITIATION OF HP – HISTORIC PROPERTY ZONING FOR BANK OF DOUGLAS AT 3925 N. BROWN AVENUE TO PLACE THE PROPERTY ON THE SCOTTSDALE HISTORIC REGISTER. MOTION WAS SECONDED by Commissioner Lennon, WHICH CARRIED 5-0.

Mr. Bischoff requested information on what was included under the historical umbrella. Ms. Abele stated the City formally recognizes the property. There are incentives that are provided to historical properties.

Mr. Bischoff stated he felt adding the second story would improve the looks of the building. Ms. Abele stated adding a second story would not be a problem as long as it keeps with the character.

Chairwoman Johnson requested that the Historic Preservation Commission consider approving Cavalliere's Blacksmith Shop Historic Preservation Plan – Design Guidelines.

(There was no public testimony.)

MOTION WAS MADE by Commissioner Petersen to APPROVE CAVALLIERE'S BLACKSMITH SHOP HISTORIC PRESERVATION PLAN – DESIGN GUIDELINES AT 3805 N. BROWN AVENUE. MOTION WAS SECONDED by Commissioner Sydnor, WHICH CARRIED 5-0.

Chairwoman Johnson requested that the Historic Preservation Commission consider approving Our Lady of Perpetual Help Mission Church Historic Preservation Plan – Design Guidelines.

Commissioner Sydnor declared a conflict and did not participate in the discussion or the vote.

Chairwoman Johnson opened public testimony.

David Schiffman Smith inquired if the buttresses on the exterior of the south side of the building should be described in the plan. Mr. Meserve stated the buttresses are now on the interior enclosed by the arcade.

Chairwoman Johnson closed public testimony.

MOTION WAS MADE by Commissioner Wilson TO APPROVE OUR LADY OF PERPETUAL HELP MISSION CHURCH HISTORIC PRESERVATION PLAN – DESIGN GUIDELINES AT 3821 N. BROWN AVENUE. MOTION WAS SECONDED by Commissioner Petersen, WHICH CARRIED 4-0 WITH Commissioner Sydnor ABSTAINING.

AMENDMENT FOR RECORDS CHECKS IN ARCHAEOLOGY ORDINANCE

Mr. Meserve reported the City has received complaints from applicants about the need for record checks, the cost and time for archaeologists to prepare the records checks, and about the information being redundant. Applicants have submitted approximately fifty records checks to meet ordinance requirements. City staff has discussed a potential ordinance amendment and other options to address these concerns.

Mr. Meserve stated records checks have been required from applicants to comply with the ordinance since August 1999. Since then, the City hired a qualified archaeologist to complete a citywide records check in March 2001. The citywide records check information is now available for Preservation staff use on Arcview maps and tables and can be used by staff as a reference for all new development applications in the City. The data can be made available to other staff as a reference. Applicants may have a legitimate concern about the potential for redundancy since each records check is completed on a mile radius of a proposed project. This standard coverage leads to duplicate data searches for areas like

the downtown Airpark. This duplication for areas is in addition to the duplication of information between new records checks and the data contained in the city wide records check.

Mr. Meserve noted the citywide records check completed for the city by a qualified archaeologist in 2001 is sufficient to satisfy the requirements for a records check in Section 46-132 of Ordinance NO. 3243. Therefore, effective immediately, no further records checks will be required in these exempt situations since the ordinance provisions requiring such records check have been satisfied and the data is available to City staff for reference as needed.

Mr. Meserve stated there are three sentences to be deleted from the ordinance and no additional language is being proposed.

MOTION WAS MADE by Commissioner Sydnor INITIATE THE PROPOSED ORDINANCE AMENDMENT TO REMOVE THE RECORDS CHECK REQUIREMENT FROM SECTION 46-132 OF ORDINANCE 3242 AND RECOMMEND CITY COUNCIL APPROVE THE AMENDMENT. SECONDED by Commissioner Wilson, WHICH CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY 5-0.

Mr. Cafarella stated this revision to the ordinance is making it less burdensome for the private sector.

DRAFT COMMISSION LETTER ON OLIVE TREES

Commissioner Lennon passed out a copy of the draft letter addressed to Ms. Debra Baird, Director Parks Recreation and Facilities, that outlines the significance of the Olive Trees planted by Winfield Scott. At the last meeting, the Commission discussed placing these Olive Trees on the register and zoning them HP to preserve them. Commissioner Lennon stated the picture of the Olive Trees he passed out is of poor quality. The Scottsdale Historical Society has the original picture. A discussion ensued that the letter should be forwarded to the City Council and newspapers.

The Commission discussed the fact that the Olive Trees are an important historical part of Scottsdale and they would request the olive trees continue to be protected and cared for.

The consensus of the Commission was that the draft letter needed a little fine-tuning but they were supportive of its intent.

Commissioner Lennon stated he is in the process of sending in an application to the Arizona Heirloom Fruit Registry.

COMMITTEE DISCUSSION/REPORTS

Historic Register Committee

Commissioner Petersen reported that the Historic Register Committee met on March 6, 2002. She stated they discussed the 22 single-family residence in Downtown Survey area. The consensus was to discontinue consideration of 18 houses because of remodeling/alterations that have changed the character, and/or because of changes from a residential to commercial look.

Commissioner Petersen stated four residences will continue to be studied because they are associated with significant people in Scottsdale.

Commissioner Petersen stated the members would like the Commission to provide direction regarding individual residences that might be presented in the future, regarding a theme that could fall between Early Town and Subdivisions, suggesting "Agriculture/Agrarian" or simply "Farming" as being connected to Scottsdale's early roots.

She reported that the committee discussed archeological sites and context themes.

Chairwoman Johnson volunteered to take pictures of the 22 houses.

Commissioner Sydnor stated regarding the Scottsdale Post World War II Residential Subdivision Development study, he felt that priority should be given to the most threatened individual residential properties. He further stated that maybe they could look at them on a case by case basis.

Commissioner Petersen reported that the Austin House has been sand blasted down to the original brick and they will be putting a new roof on it this week.

The Commission discussed that they would continue to add to the list of single-family residences. Ms. Abele noted that there are 42 properties in the City of Scottsdale that have been identified as location addresses. It was noted that that list would be provided at the next meeting.

Education Outreach

Commissioner Wilson stated that the Education Outreach Committee met yesterday. The first item they discussed was Scottsdale's Early Town Buildings brochure. The consensus was that the size of the brochure would work. She further stated the brochure would be reviewed once more for accuracy. She requested that the Commission approve the content and pictures and leave the final layout to the City's design staff.

Ms. Abele suggested that they not use the actual name of the Historic Preservation Officer but rather just the title.

MOTION WAS MADE BY Commissioner Sydnor TO APPROVE THE CONTENT AND PICTURES IN THE SCOTTSDALE'S EARLY TOWN BUILDING BROCHURE AS SUBMITTED BY THE EDUCATION OUTREACH COMMITTEE. MOTION WAS SECONDED by Commissioner Petersen, which passed unanimously.

Commissioner Wilson inquired if there was money in the budget for printing. Mr. Cafarella stated the funds were included in last year's budget.

Commissioner Wilson stated they have not discussed the quantities that would be printed. It was suggested they talk to the tourism people regarding distribution.

Commissioner Wilson stated the Committee heard a report on the Winfield Scott birthday and the Historical Society Home tour. She stated they would be distributing materials to third or fourth grade classes that study community history that list all of the different resources that are available.

MINUTES

Commissioner Sydnor recommended the following change:

Page 7, paragraph 8: Father Heaver should be spelled Hever.

Chairwoman Johnson stated that the minutes of February 14, 2002 stood approved as amended.

HPO/STAFF REPORT

Mr. Meserve reported that the original HP-historic property overlay zoning on Cavalliere's Blacksmith Shop was incorrect. He further stated it needs to be corrected to include the entire historic building.

Mr. Meserve stated they have received the signed agreement from the Arizona State Parks and State Historic Preservation Office for the \$10,000 GLG pass-through funding to conduct the Citywide multi-family housing survey.

Mr. Meserve stated the City has acquired a new City office on 6th Avenue that could be used for open houses and providing HP information.

Ms. Abele passed out design guidelines used in Utah in preparation for the Commission's discussion on second story additions.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS/PUBLIC COMMENTS

Commissioner Sydnor reported that the Incentives Committee would be meeting on April 4th at 5:30 p.m. He discussed who would be on the committee and provided information on their backgrounds.

Commissioner Sydnor inquired if they would be doing a similar review of the Historic Preservation Ordinance as with the Archaeology Ordinance. Ms. Abele stated Phoenix reviews their ordinance every five years but some communities don't review it once it is passed.

Commissioner Sydnor stated that two architects have passed away, Dwight Busby and Dick Drover. Commissioner Sydnor presented information on their many accomplishments.

Mr. Meserve stated the Scottsdale Historical Hall of Fame Dinner is scheduled for April 10th. They will be honoring Lois McFarland a past Commission member.

FUTURE MEETINGS AND AGENDA ITEMS

Work Session on March 28, 2002

Mr. Meserve stated the Commission would discuss policies for second story additions.

Meeting adjourned at 6:55 p.m.

Submitted by:

Sheryl Hancey, For the Record Court Reporters
P:31402min